



Clean Ohio Fund

Ohio Public Works Commission - District 6
Ohio Natural Resource Assistance Council (NRAC)

Eastgate Regional Council of Governments
City Center One Building
100 E. Federal Street, Suite 1000
Youngstown, OH 44503

Round 12 Scoring Methodology

Clean Ohio Fund- Round 12

Scoring Methodology

Applicant Name: _____

Applicant Contact: _____

Project Title: _____

Date Application Received: _____

Project Reviewer: _____

Clean Ohio Funds Available for this Round	\$ _____
Clean Ohio Funds Requested	\$ _____
Total Project Cost	\$ _____
Total Points (180 maximum points)	_____
Project Ranking	_____

*Is the amount of Clean Ohio Funds requested from District 6 NRAC available? _____

*If not, is the applicant willing and able to lower their request for Clean Ohio Funds and/or change the scope of the project and still complete the project? (*Attachment B # 13*) _____

District 6 NRAC Project Action: (Check only one)

Project Approved as submitted

Project held for future consideration pending clarification of:

1. _____

2. _____

Project Disapproved

PART I: PRELIMINARY SCREENING

YES NO

_____ Applicant is eligible entity

_____ Complete application received by deadline

Applicant must clearly demonstrate that the primary purpose of the project involves at least one of the following from A. or B. below:

A. Open Space (Sec. 164.22 A)

_____ acquires land for parks

_____ acquires land for public forests

_____ acquires land for wetland preservation or restoration

_____ acquires land for natural areas protecting endangered species

_____ acquires land for other natural areas

_____ acquires land for connecting corridors for natural areas

_____ open space acquisition

_____ permanent conservation easement

B. Riparian Corridors or Watersheds (Sec. 164.22 B)

_____ Protects or enhances riparian corridors or watersheds including the protection and enhancement of streams, rivers and other waters of the state.

C. Would the project:

YES NO

_____ initiate or perpetuate man made or engineered hydromodification projects not primarily designed to protect or enhance water quality and /or natural features? Such projects include, but are not limited to, dams, ditch development, channelization, dredging, sedimentation, and stream bank erosion control by use of riprap or wall construction, bank clearing, bank armoring or bank hardening of any kind.

_____ fund current legal obligations (such as fines, penalties, litigation expenses, mitigation or reclamation) under state or federal laws or local ordinances?

_____ fund facilities other than those required to provide public access to or use of open space?

_____ fund facilities for active recreation, such as tennis courts, ball fields or recreation centers?

_____ accelerate the runoff of untreated water?

_____ encourage invasive nonnative plant and animal species?

_____ fund construction activities that exceed the cost of the appraised value of the land?

If YES is checked for any of the above in C, the project is ineligible. If the project meets Preliminary Scoring Requirements move on to Page 3.

ATTACHMENTS/COMPLETENESS REVIEW:

AFTER A REVIEW FOR COMPLETENESS, THE D6 NRAC WILL SCORE ALL APPLICATIONS. **BE CERTAIN EACH OF THE ITEMS LISTED BELOW IS ATTACHED. THE DISTRICT 6 NRAC REQUIRES THAT ALL SIGNED DOCUMENTS SUBMITTED INCLUDE THE ORIGINAL SIGNATURE.**

- A certified copy of the authorization by the governing body of the applicant authorizing a designated official to sign and submit this application and execute contracts with the commission. This individual should sign under 6.0, Applicant Certification, below.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- A certification signed by the applicant's chief financial officer stating all local share funds required for the project will be available on or before the dates listed in the Project Schedule section.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- A cooperation agreement, (if the project involves more than entity) which identifies the fiscal and administrative responsibilities of each participant.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Resolution of Support (please refer to section 164.23(B)(1) of the Ohio Revised Code for guidance).
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Information concerning the coordination of the project among local political subdivisions, state agencies, federal agencies, community organizations, conservation organizations, and local business groups.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Supporting Documentation: Materials such as additional project description, photographs, and/or other information to assist your District 6 NRAC in ranking your project. Be sure to include supplements which may be required by your District 6 NRAC.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- For Land Acquisition Projects: Applicants **MUST** provide documentation of either a Signed Purchase Agreement or Letter of Intent to Sell.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- For Restoration Projects: Applicants **MUST** provide documentation of one of the following: Stamped Preliminary plans by architect, landscape architect, or other qualified professional; Documentation of Secured Appropriate Permits or Permitting Process; Project Schedule.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Include a conceptual site development plan. If appropriate, address storm water retention elements in the plan.
Included _____ Not Included _____

ATTACHMENTS/COMPLETENESS REVIEW...continued:

- All applications should include the Project location identified on at least two maps:
 - A location map on a township/municipality scale with the project location clearly identified and major roads and highways labeled.
Included _____ Not Included _____
 - An Aerial map zoomed into the parcel level with parcel and/or conservation easement boundaries drawn, roads, road names and streams identified.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Acquisition costs must be supported by a purchase contract, letter of intent, or other acceptable documentation. Site Improvement costs must be supported by a formal estimate provided by an architect, landscape architect, or other professional. Costs may also be supported by quotes.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Proposed Declaration of Restrictions; also include restrictions for any other funding sources.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Identification of any participation by state agencies that may have expertise regarding the project and may provide assistance with respect to the project.
Included _____ Not Included _____
- Justification of land value: Include in the application to the NRAC a copy of a County Tax Appraisal, a Market Analysis by a Realtor, or a copy of a recent (with in last 5 years) appraisal on the land to be purchased through the Clean Ohio Fund. This request stands if the application is for the purchase of an Easement.
 - For *LAND ACQUISITION*: If applicant provides a County Tax Appraisal to meet the criteria for justification of land value and the purchase price of the land is over 150% of the County Tax Appraisal amount, the NRAC will require an appraisal by a State certified appraiser be completed before a decision on the application will be made at the local level.
 - For *EASEMENT PURCHASE*: **If property currently has a Current Agriculture Use Value (CAUV) determined by the County Auditor, the applicant may present the following formula to the NRAC to determine the per-acre value of the Easement: $\text{Market Value (minus) CAUV (divided by) the number of acres (MV-AUV/ACRES)}$.

Included _____ Not Included _____

**If there is no CAUV on the property or the applicant chooses not to determine land value based on the above formula then the NRAC shall consider up to 60% of Fair Market Price for the value of the easement.

If applicable, *either* of the above methods may be used to determine easement value. If the applicant is requesting MORE than is determined fair by either of the above methods, the NRAC will require an analytical narrative appraisal be done on the property. The applicant has the option to provide an analytical narrative appraisal in place of either of the two above mentioned requests.

ATTACHMENTS/COMPLETENESS REVIEW...continued:

***PLEASE NOTE: OPWC WILL REQUIRE AN APPRAISAL PREPARED BY AN ODOT PREQUALIFIED APPRAISER PRIOR TO ISSUING A NOTICE TO PROCEED. LAND VALUES FOR BOTH ACQUISITION AND EASEMENTS WILL HAVE TO BE IN LINE WITH THIS FINAL APPRAISAL OR THE STATE WILL NOT FUND THE PROJECT.**

****PLEASE REVIEW THE DISTRICT 6 NRAC's SCORING METHODOLOGY TO ENSURE YOU ADDRESSED ALL APPLICATION COMPONENTS. PROPOSED PROJECTS THAT DO NOT OBTAIN A MEAN MINIMUM SCORE OF AT LEAST 40% (Total Points x .4) OF THE TOTAL POSSIBLE MAXIMUM POINTS AWARDED BY DISTRICT 6 NRAC COMMITTEE MEMBERS WILL ONLY BE FUNDED IN FULL OR PART UPON A FAVORABLE VOTE OF 8 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, AND BE CONTINGENT UPON FUNDING AVAILABILITY.**

NRAC SCORING METHODOLOGY -- Part II

NRAC’s shall consider all the following in approving or disapproving a grant: Does the project emphasize (document in application) the following pursuant to Section 164.22, ORC? Please refer to Glossary of Terms. Please allocate points to those areas the applicant has identified as project emphasis according to the level of justification given. Applicant will have identified these areas of emphasis in “Attachment A” and expanded on their importance in “Attachment B” #15 **(70 Max Points)**

Yes /No	Project Emphasis	Points Allocated (0-5)
	1. Supports comprehensive open space planning; Incorporates aesthetically pleasing and ecologically informed design	
	2. Enhances economic development that relies on recreational and ecotourism in areas of relatively high unemployment and lower incomes	
	3. Protects habitat for rare, threatened and endangered species or the preservation of high quality, viable habitat for plant and animal species	
	4. Preserves existing high quality wetlands or other scarce natural resources	
	5. Enhances educational opportunities and provides physical links to schools and afterschool centers	
	6. Preserves or restores water quality, natural stream channels, functioning floodplains, wetlands, and/or stream side forests. Preserves or restores other natural features that contribute to the quality of life and to state’s natural heritage	
	7. Reduces or eliminates nonnative, invasive species of plants or animals	
	8. Allows proper management of areas where safe hunting and trapping may take place in a manner that will preserve a balanced natural ecosystem	
	9. Increases habitat protection	
	10. Included as part of a stream corridor-wide or watershed-wide plan	
	11. Provides multiple recreational, Economic, and aesthetic preservation benefits	
	12. Preserves or restores flood plain and stream side forest functions	
	13. Preserves headwater streams	
	14. Restores or preserves aquatic biological communities	

Part II SCORE: Total all allocated points _____ / 70 (max points)

Comments:

NRAC SCORING METHODOLOGY -- Part III

The NRAC shall consider the following in approving or disapproving a grant:

FISCAL AND PROJECT MANAGEMENT

1. Percentage of Clean Ohio matching funds necessary to complete project: *(Application 1.2)*

<input type="checkbox"/> 75% (Required)	<input type="checkbox"/> 74-70% (1 point)	<input type="checkbox"/> 69-65% (2 points)	<input type="checkbox"/> 64-60% (3 points)	<input type="checkbox"/> <60% (4 points)
---	---	--	--	--

2. Readiness to proceed factors: If project contains acquisition and restoration check appropriate factors in both (maximum is 20 points if both acquisition AND restoration) *(Application Section 2.0)*

Land Acquisition Projects: Applicants must provide documentation of a pending land transaction:

<input type="checkbox"/> Signed <u>purchase</u> contract (10 points)	<input type="checkbox"/> Letter of intent to sell (5 points)
---	---

Restoration Projects: Applicants must provide AT LEAST ONE of the following:

<input type="checkbox"/> Stamped preliminary plans by architect, landscape architect, or other qualified professional (6 points)
<input type="checkbox"/> Documentation of appropriate permits secured or permitting process (3 points)
<input type="checkbox"/> Project schedule (1 points)

3. Level of Collaborative Participation: Participation means **active** involvement with or towards the project through in-kind services and/or funding (written documentation required; minimum cash donation of \$500). **Applicant MAY NOT count itself as a participant. (1 point for each category; maximum 2 points)** *(Attachment B #3)*

<input type="checkbox"/> Local political subdivisions	<input type="checkbox"/> State/county agencies	<input type="checkbox"/> Federal agencies
<input type="checkbox"/> Community organizations	<input type="checkbox"/> Conservation/watershed organizations	<input type="checkbox"/> Local business groups

4. Level of coordination: Coordination means project carries out goals of an agency/organization or multiple agencies/organizations (written documentation required). *(Attachment B #4) (Check All That Apply)*
(1 point each, maximum 2 points)

<input type="checkbox"/> Local political subdivisions	<input type="checkbox"/> State/county agencies	<input type="checkbox"/> Federal agencies
<input type="checkbox"/> Community organizations	<input type="checkbox"/> Conservation/watershed organizations	

5. Operation and Maintenance once project is completed. *(Application Section 3.0-E and Refer to Attachment B #5)*
(Check ONE)

<input type="checkbox"/> Operation & maintenance plan and resources, if appropriate, in place (attach plan documentation) (5 points)
<input type="checkbox"/> Operation plan only (3 points)
<input type="checkbox"/> Limited operation plan, volunteers available, no resources (1 point)

Points: _____ / 33

LOCAL PRINCIPLES AND COORDINATION

6. Level of Community Planning with other Open Space, Riparian Corridor, Trails, Farmland Protection or Urban Revitalization Projects under the Clean Ohio Fund within the District or in other Public Works Commission districts.

Applicant **MUST** provide supporting documentation of plan/plans **AND** cite where within the plan/plans project and/or project components are discussed. (*Application Section 1.4*) (*Attachment B # 6*) (*Check All That Apply*)

- Carries out an adopted community plan **(2 points)**
- Carries out an adopted watershed plan **(2 points)**
- Carries out other adopted plan that follows in the spirit of the Clean Ohio Conservation Fund **(2 points)**

7. Community benefits: Relative economic, social/recreational and environmental benefits the proposed project will bring to the geographical area represented by the NRAC as compared to other projects. (*2 points each, max 6 points*) (*Attachment B #7*)

- Economic **(2 points)**
- Social/recreational **(2 points)**
- Environmental **(2 points)**

8. Public Access once project is completed: (*Application Section 3.0 D*) (*Attachment B #8*) (*Check ONE*)

- Physical Access **(3 points)**
- Visual Access **(0 points)**

9. Applicant Priority: What is the applicant priority for this project? (**Check one**) (*Attachment B #9A*)

- #1 **(5 points)**
- #2 **(3 points)**
- #3 **(1 points)**

10. The Median Household Income (MHI) for the community where the project is located is in what percent of the State of Ohio's MHI? (*Attachment B #10*) (*Refer to [State of Ohio MHI table](#)*)

- BELOW 70% **(5 points)**
- 70% to 79.9% **(4 points)**
- 80% to 89.9% **(3 points)**
- 90% to 99.9% **(2 points)**
- 100% and over **(0 points)**

11. Is the majority (50% or more) of the project located within an Urbanized Area? Provide map of Urbanized Area with project location noted. Please refer to [Urbanized Boundary Map](#) on Eastgate's website. (*Attachment B #11*)

- Yes **(5 points)**
- No **(0 points)**

Points: _____ / 30

GENERAL CONCERNS

12. Natural Resource Viability is how important is the project to the viability of the natural resources affected by the project. The project identifies and protects: (*Attachment B #12*) (*Check All That Apply*) (Applicant **MUST** provide supporting documentation)

- Applicant has supporting evidence of federally listed, extinct, extirpated, or newly identified species found in Ohio (**7 Points**)
- State Endangered (**5 points**)
- State Threatened (**3 points**)
- State Concern (**1 points**)

13. Property Rights: Applicant has explained and provided proper documentation of the property rights, with regards to mineral rights and extraction that will be conveyed in the purchase agreement or conservation easement, including the date of any pre-existing lease or similar agreement on the mineral rights, including oil, gas and/or extraction leases. Clean Ohio Funds cannot be used to purchase parcels that will be timbered. (*Attachment B #13*)

Please provide the following documentation for the property being acquired:

1. Property Rights (please check the applicable line):
 - Applicant will retain property AND mineral rights and prohibits future mineral extraction lease agreements.
 - Property has an existing mineral extraction lease agreement, but applicant will retain property AND mineral rights.
 - Applicant retains ONLY property rights. Mineral rights have been severed from the property for future mineral extraction allowance.

2. Please indicate if there are legal restrictions prohibiting surface disturbance within the property. If yes, documentation must be provided.
 - Yes (**8 points**)
 - No (**0 points**)

Points: _____ / **24**

14. Other Project Factors:

- _____ Project addresses a situation where action must be taken now or opportunity will be lost forever **(0-5 points)**
(Attachment B #14)
- _____ Project is contiguous with an existing preserved open space or riparian area **(0-5 points)**
(Attachment B #15)
- _____ Land involved in the project
 - 200 or more acres **(4 points)**
 - 100-199 acres **(3 points)**
 - 50-99 acres **(2 points)**
 - Less than 50 acres **(1 point)**
- _____ Amount of Clean Ohio Funding Requested:
 - less than \$200,000 **(4 points)**
 - \$200,000- \$399,999 **(3 points)**
 - \$400,000 - \$599,999 **(2 points)**
 - \$600,000 - \$799,999 **(1 point)**
 - \$800,000 or more- **(0 points)**

15. NRAC Member priority points (0-5 points): _____

Points: _____ / **23**

Part III SCORE: Total all points on each page _____ / 110 (max points)

TOTAL SCORE: Add all scores from Part II and Part III

Part II Score + Part III Score = Total Score (max 180 points)

+ =

PROPOSED PROJECTS THAT DO NOT OBTAIN A MEAN MINIMUM SCORE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS OF AT LEAST 40% (72 Points) OF THE TOTAL POSSIBLE MAXIMUM POINTS THAT COULD BE AWARDED BY DISTRICT 6 NRAC COMMITTEE MEMBERS WILL ONLY BE FUNDED IN FULL OR PART UPON A FAVORABLE VOTE OF 8 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, AND BE CONTINGENT UPON FUNDING AVAILABILITY.