Table of Contents

Executive Summary ........................................................................................................... 1

Project Description .......................................................................................................... 3

Project Location .............................................................................................................. 6

Funds, Sources & Uses ..................................................................................................... 9

Merit Criteria .................................................................................................................... 11

Project Readiness ........................................................................................................... 23
Mission Statement
The SMART² Network will connect Strategic & Sustainable, Medical & Manufacturing, Academic & Arts, Residential & Recreational, and Technology & Training centers in the heart of Eastern Ohio Appalachia’s largest metropolitan area - the City of Youngstown. The project will provide autonomous transit shuttles, transit waiting environments, pedestrian and bicycle facilities, green infrastructure, streetscaping, and wayfinding linking major regional anchor institutions impacting economic resurgence across the Mahoning Valley, including Youngstown State University, Mercy Health, Youngstown Business Incubator, and Eastern Gateway Community College.
Executive Summary

Project Description
Eastgate Regional Council of Governments (Eastgate) is applying for funding through the USDOT BUILD program to develop the Youngstown SMART² Network connecting Strategic & Sustainable, Medical & Manufacturing, Academic & Arts, Residential & Recreational, and Technology & Training centers in the heart of the Mahoning Valley region. SMART² will enhance mobility, improve safety, and integrate technology into a modern and efficient multimodal transportation system in Downtown Youngstown that is responsive and adaptive to the needs of current and future users. With less than a quarter of the vehicle volume today in Downtown Youngstown as compared to 50 years ago, SMART² will capitalize on existing roadway capacity to incorporate improved pedestrian and bicycle facilities, autonomous transit shuttles, transit waiting environments, green infrastructure, streetscaping, and wayfinding, so as to efficiently connect major regional anchor institutions impacting economic resurgence in the region, including Youngstown State University, Mercy Health, Youngstown Business Incubator, and Eastern Gateway Community College.

Project Location
Eastgate, the area’s Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO), is the applicant for this critical transportation infrastructure project because of its regional impact, which offers benefits well beyond the project area and into the surrounding rural Appalachian communities. The project is located in the heart of the City of Youngstown, the most densely populated in Appalachian Ohio. The revitalized Youngstown Central Business District (CBD) employs over 8,000 workers and has a downtown residential population that has nearly doubled since 2010. Youngstown’s CBD has the greatest Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of any census tract in the metropolitan region, provides the highest concentration of jobs in the region, and represents the center of opportunity for the region’s undeserved and distressed rural populations.

Grant Funds, Sources and Uses of Funds
Eastgate’s BUILD Request for the project is $10,853,192. In addition, $4,879,451 in Committed Federal Funds and $10,541,689 in Non-Federal Match comprise the total project development cost of $26,274,332. The locally committed funds come from project partners that include:
Merit Criteria
SMART² will address each of the Merit Criteria highlighted to the right. Quantitative benefits for the project results in a **1.16:1 Benefit-Cost Ratio** as detailed in the BCA.

### Project Readiness
The SMART² Network involves right-sizing the City’s transportation network to meet the needs of modern-day Youngstown’s population size, traffic requirements, and economic development opportunities. Based on engineering review and recent traffic studies, no significant, negative transportation/traffic effects are anticipated. Updated traffic studies will be completed in conjunction with project final engineering.

DriveOhio, the state’s center for smart mobility, has committed to providing this project with technical, legislative and procurement support relative to implementation of autonomous vehicles.

The SMART² Network project is prepared to begin detailed design immediately upon receipt of BUILD funds. Preliminary engineering is already underway and is expected to be completed in 2020, well in advance of the obligation deadline. The entire project is located within the right-of-way under agency control.

### Repurposing Excess Roadway Capacity
Both Fifth Avenue (existing 5-lanes / ADT 9,273) and Rayen Avenue (existing 4-lanes / ADT 4,533) provide excess pavement width and roadway capacity that allow for maximum flexibility in detailed design to accommodate any required refinements without the need for design exceptions, utility relocations or right-of-way acquisition.
Project Description

The SMART² Solution
Addressing Transportation Challenges

The SMART² Network will connect Strategic & Sustainable, Medical & Manufacturing, Academic & Arts, Residential & Recreational, and Technology & Training centers in the heart of the Mahoning Valley, by enhancing mobility, improving safety, and integrating technology into a modern and efficient multimodal transportation system in Downtown Youngstown in response to the need for transportation infrastructure that meets the needs of the new Youngstown population and economy. SMART² will connect major regional anchor institutions that include Youngstown State University, Mercy Health, Youngstown Business Incubator, Eastern Gateway Community College, and the WRTA Federal Station, SMART² will incorporate enhanced pedestrian and bicycle facilities, autonomous transit shuttles, transit waiting environments, green infrastructure, streetscaping, and wayfinding. Federal investment in SMART² will allow Youngstown and the Mahoning Valley region to reverse decades of outward migration and disinvestment by building upon recent and continuing public and private investments in the project area, including the $30 million Mahoning Valley Innovation & Commercialization Center, the $20 million West Coast Chill Can manufacturing facility, the $3 million Youngstown Foundation Amphitheater, and the $850,000 Mill Creek MetroParks Connector trail. Together, our local, regional and state partners stand behind this catalytic project to revitalize the heart of the Mahoning Valley and improve the quality of life of all rural and urban residents who rely on Downtown Youngstown as the area wide economic engine for commerce, service, health care innovation, education and workforce development.

The SMART² Network will provide a positive transformation within our region, impacting not only Youngstown, but also the surrounding communities, residents, and businesses. This SMART² Network proposal builds upon more than ten years of planning and coalition building amongst the project partners, enabling the accelerated transition of an Appalachian community’s economy to one reliant on education, health care, high value-adding services, and advanced manufacturing technology. The proposal has been significantly and deliberately enhanced from last year’s “highly rated” SMART² TIGER proposal, building upon an even greater economic and construction momentum, with an expanded and refined project scope. This proposal includes stronger and broader partnerships, provides greater regional economic impact, and offers significantly increased cost share and private investment.

Through an innovative partnership with DriveOhio, an autonomous shuttle service will be provided on Fifth Avenue, Rayen Avenue, and Park Avenue, capitalizing on existing roadway capacity along these arterials. DriveOhio will provide the autonomous vehicle technical, legislative and procurement support.

Complete street design elements will be applied to seven streets including Fifth Avenue, Rayen Avenue, Front Street, Commerce Street, Phelps Street, Federal Street, and Park Avenue, providing safe pedestrian and bicycle-friendly access for residents, workers, and visitors. Simultaneously, this complete streets reconstruction will repair aging infrastructure.

SMART² enhancements include replacing existing stormwater drainage, striping bike lanes, adding a median, restoring sidewalk, delineating bus stops and crosswalks, installing street lighting, and planting landscaping. Each of these proposed enhancements will contribute to the economic revitalization of the region by facilitating the safe and reliable movement of people and ideas.
Rural Benefits
SMART² as Gateway to Regional Prosperity

Expanding Regional Transit Connections
WRTA provides on-demand service county-wide in Mahoning County, including rural areas of the county. In addition, several WRTA fixed route service lines extend beyond the Youngstown Urbanized Area: 26 Boardman East Loop, 27 Austintown Loop, and 23/25 Canfield/Boardman Loop.

Educating the Regional Workforce
Youngstown State University (YSU) is the engine for the region, impacting the citizens in communities far beyond the urban core and into the heart of traditional underresourced populations of rural Appalachia. Some 43% of YSU’s students and 34% of YSU’s employees reside in these rural areas.

Increasing Rural Access to Health Care
Youngstown’s St. Elizabeth Health Center is a federally-designated Rural Referral Center and includes a Rural Residency Training program for dental residents, enabling expanded access to oral health services to disadvantaged and underresourced residents in rural counties adjacent to the metro area. The SMART² Network will provide increased access to the St. Elizabeth Health Center campus and resolve service gaps for those patients who depend upon public transportation and are currently limited in accessing care because of fixed bus schedules and headways. Increased patient access via transit hubs relieves demand for non-emergency healthcare.

Supporting Farm to Market
The Youngstown Neighborhood Development Corporation (YNDC), in collaboration with the Mercy Health Foundation Mahoning Valley and other local partners, has launched the Produce Perks SNAP Double-Up Program.

Residents can double their Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program/EBT benefits by up $30 per day by purchasing fruits and vegetables at Cultivate: A Co-op Café, located in the core of the SMART² Network project area. This produce is grown and sold by regional farmers, resulting in increased local sales.
Crown Jewel of the Mahoning Valley
Regional Center of Eastern Ohio Appalachia

Downtown Youngstown: Home to Thriving and Growing Regional Anchor Institutions

The SMART² Network proposal is a strategic and integrated investment in multimodal improvements that will facilitate greater connectivity between rural and urban economic anchors of the Mahoning Valley. The SMART² Network connects Youngstown’s urban core, which is home to nearly 15,000 residents, to key regional anchor institutions such as:

- **Mercy Health Youngstown Region (Mercy Health)**, located at the northern edge of the SMART² Network area, and which employs 4,600 people, Supports 40 physician practices with 240 physicians at Mercy Health Youngstown’s inpatient hospitals, emergency departments, and outpatient facilities serve both the urban core and outlying rural areas and the St. Elizabeth Hospital Trauma Center is the only level one trauma center serving this part of Appalachia between Pittsburgh and Cleveland. In 2017, Mercy facilities served 42,756 individuals through inpatient hospital admissions for a total of 283,743 patient days and provided 861,816 outpatient visits including over 205,757 emergency room visits.

- **Youngstown State University (YSU)** which employs 2,053 people and educates 12,500 students, and which has recently received $3 million in federal funding and $7 million in state funding to construct the Mahoning Valley Innovation and Commercialization Center, a new shared use advanced manufacturing training, workforce development, education, and research facility located in the heart of the SMART² Network project area.

- **Youngstown Business Incubator (YBI)**, an internationally renowned and successful business incubator employing 35 people and currently serving 55 incubator companies. With support from the Department of Commerce and the State of Ohio, YBI recently opened a new $5 million Additive Manufacturing incubator, projected to create an additional 400 regional jobs in the near term, through business attraction and the creation of 5-10 spin out technology companies.

- **Eastern Gateway Community College (EGCC)**, employing 225 people and educating 3,100 students in Associate Degree programs required for today’s economy.

- The City of Youngstown’s **Central Business District**, employing nearly 8,000 people.

- New urban advanced manufacturing facilities such as **West Coast Chill Can (WCC)** that will employ more than 250 people in the manufacture of a patented self-chilling beverage can.

The SMART² Network improves mobility amongst these key anchor institutions by enhancing a citywide multimodal transit circuit connecting residents and visitors to strategic medical, manufacturing, academic, residential, recreational, technological, and employment opportunities. By connecting the downtown anchor institutions, BUILD funding will accelerate the community’s transition from a manufacturing economy to an advanced manufacturing and technology based economy.
These Downtown Youngstown streets comprise the core of the SMART² Network:

**Fifth Avenue** is the one-mile, north-south spine of the SMART² Network, connecting Mercy Health, YSU, and WRTA transit hub to the central business district, with its technology block, residential development, and access to Mill Creek Park, which is among the largest urban parks in the nation.

**Rayen Avenue** is an east-west connector to educational institutions, including Eastern Gateway Community College, YSU, and the Youngstown City School District. Rayen Avenue extends one mile to the new privately constructed West Coast Chill Can Manufacturing, Research, and Development Center, which forecasts 250 employees.

**Front Street** and **Commerce Street** also serve as key east-west downtown connectors linking mixed-use residential and retail sites to the technology block, including the Youngstown Business Incubator buildings, America Makes, the National Additive Manufacturing Innovation Institute, and the planned Mahoning Valley Innovation and Commercialization Center (MVICC), which recently received $3 million of federal funding and $7 million of state funding to support construction.

**Park Avenue** is an east-west street connecting distressed residential neighborhoods to the Mercy Health campus, the Stambaugh Auditorium, and the greater SMART² Network.
Building off Recent & Ongoing Investments
Continuing the Momentum

Downtown Youngstown: On the Upward Swing
Downtown Youngstown, the regional cultural, educational, and economic center of the Mahoning Valley, includes some 565 business establishments having 8,000 employees. This represents the highest concentration of businesses within Mahoning and Trumbull Counties and provides $449 million in annual sales. Imminent additional downtown redevelopment includes the $30 million Mahoning Valley Innovation & Commercialization Center at Youngstown State University, the $20 million West Coast Chill Can manufacturing and research campus, and more than $14 million in other planned public infrastructure investment over the next two years, including construction of a riverside park and amphitheater.

The SMART² project area is well positioned for high-impact private investment. Over 327,000 square feet of office, 34,000 of warehouse, and 10-acres of industrial land are currently available for development within the SMART² project area, including a 1.56-acre site with rail access. This area is eligible for New Market Tax Credits and the impacted census tracts have recently secured an Opportunity Zone designation, further enriching property value. Including the $32 million investment in the new Hilton Double Tree Hotel, a recent $5 million expansion of the Youngstown Business Incubator, a $6.2 million renovation of the downtown YMCA, and over $28 million in new YSU student housing, the project area has seen more than $600 million in investment in recent years. Youngstown also has more than $81 million in water improvements planned to support area redevelopment.
**Project Funding Sources**

**Summary**
Eastgate’s **BUILD Request** for the project is **$10,853,192**. In addition, $4,879,451 in Committed Federal Funds and $10,541,689 in Non-Federal Match comprise the total project development cost of $26,274,332.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Funding Sources</th>
<th>Funding Category</th>
<th>Funding Amount</th>
<th>Percent of Total Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Committed Federal Funds</td>
<td>$4,879,451</td>
<td>18.6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Federal Match</td>
<td>$10,541,689</td>
<td>40.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BUILD Request</strong></td>
<td><strong>$10,853,192</strong></td>
<td><strong>41.3%</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Project Cost:</strong></td>
<td><strong>$26,274,332</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Funding Sources: By Project Component**
The table below summarizes the total project cost broken down by Committed Federal Funds, Non-Federal Match, and BUILD Request for each project component:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Funding Sources: By Project Component</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Committed Federal Funds</th>
<th>Non-Federal Match</th>
<th>BUILD Request</th>
<th>Total Project Cost</th>
<th>Percent of Total Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Amphitheater Trail</td>
<td>$800,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$850,000</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Extension</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Autonomous Shuttles</td>
<td></td>
<td>$740,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$740,000</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bel Park Transit Hub</td>
<td>$750,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$95,464</td>
<td>$845,464</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bikeshare System</td>
<td>$220,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$80,000</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Center City Bike Trail</td>
<td>$373,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$423,000</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commerce Street</td>
<td>$439,776</td>
<td>$109,944</td>
<td>$181,040</td>
<td>$730,760</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Federal Street</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$90,988</td>
<td>$90,988</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fifth Avenue</td>
<td>$2,840,000</td>
<td>$3,515,000</td>
<td>$4,184,565</td>
<td>$10,539,565</td>
<td>40.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Front Street</td>
<td>$1,028,923</td>
<td>$257,231</td>
<td>$332,212</td>
<td>$1,618,366</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Park Avenue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$86,750</td>
<td>$86,750</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phelps Street</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$37,444</td>
<td>$287,444</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rayen Avenue</td>
<td>$570,752</td>
<td>$3,416,514</td>
<td>$482,734</td>
<td>$4,470,000</td>
<td>17.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transit Hubs</td>
<td>$850,000</td>
<td></td>
<td>$108,650</td>
<td>$958,650</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$1,097,049</td>
<td>$1,097,049</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$3,236,296</td>
<td>$3,236,296</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Funding Totals:</strong></td>
<td><strong>$4,879,451</strong></td>
<td><strong>$10,541,689</strong></td>
<td><strong>$10,853,192</strong></td>
<td><strong>$26,274,332</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

EASTGATE Regional Council of Governments
Non-Federal (Local) Match

The Project’s Non-Federal (Local) match contributions are summarized by sponsor and project description below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sponsor</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>Local Match</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eastgate Regional Council of Governments</td>
<td>Bikeshare System</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Gateway Community College</td>
<td>Bikeshare System</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Foundations</td>
<td>Bikeshare System</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mercy Health</td>
<td>Streetscape</td>
<td>$905,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mercy Health</td>
<td>Transit Hubs</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio Department of Transportation</td>
<td>Rayen Avenue</td>
<td>$3,273,826</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Reserve Transit Authority</td>
<td>Capital Budget</td>
<td>$600,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Youngstown</td>
<td>Bel Park Transit Hub</td>
<td>$750,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Youngstown</td>
<td>Center City Bike Trail</td>
<td>$373,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Youngstown</td>
<td>Fifth Avenue Stormwater Improvements</td>
<td>$1,300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Youngstown</td>
<td>Phelps Complete Streets</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Youngstown</td>
<td>STBG Local Match</td>
<td>$1,219,863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown Foundation</td>
<td>Amphitheater Trail Extension</td>
<td>$800,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown State University</td>
<td>Cash and Right of Way</td>
<td>$600,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Match: $10,541,689

Budget Summary

Project Costs by project development category are summarized below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Percent of Total Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Roadway Capital Construction Costs</td>
<td>$17,823,873</td>
<td>67.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multimodal Infrastructure and Equipment</td>
<td>$4,117,114</td>
<td>15.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Services</td>
<td>$3,236,296</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td>$1,097,049</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Project Development Cost: $26,274,332

Detailed cost information by line item is provided with the supplementary information to the application at: http://eastgatecog.org/SMART2
Better Utilizing Infrastructure to Leverage Development
Advancing BUILD program goals

Pages 11-22 detail how SMART\(^2\) will address each of the BUILD Merit Criteria as summarized below. Detailed Benefit-Cost Analysis (BCA) calculations and methodology can be found in the BCA and BCA narrative at: http://eastgatecog.org/SMART2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Merit Criteria</th>
<th>Benefit/Cost Analysis</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SAFETY</td>
<td>Crash Reduction</td>
<td>$17.05M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STATE OF GOOD REPAIR</td>
<td>Life Cycle Costs</td>
<td>$5.26M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECONOMIC COMPETITIVENESS</td>
<td>Property Values</td>
<td>$8.87M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION</td>
<td>Air Quality</td>
<td>$70K Annual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUALITY OF LIFE</td>
<td>Placemaking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INNOVATION</td>
<td>Autonomous Shuttles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARTNERSHIP</td>
<td>Local Match</td>
<td>$9.82M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NON-FEDERAL REVENUE</td>
<td>County Sales Tax</td>
<td>0.25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Expected Crash Reduction

The SMART² Network achieves new safety standards defined under the FAST Act’s Performance Measures. Working with the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT), Eastgate is in the process of adopting these standards.

The current right-of-way was designed for vehicle volumes more than double what was required in the 1960’s. As such, current roadways in the SMART² Network actually have five to seven times the capacity needed today. This excess capacity leads to speeding and distracted driving, resulting in increased vehicular, pedestrian, and bicycle accidents. Evidence of the current poor intersection design for pedestrians, cyclists, and transit-users is demonstrated through the map below, showing a high concentration of crashes at or near intersections in the project area. Design guidelines based on NATCO were adopted by City Council in 2017, and safety performance measures were adopted by Eastgate in 2018. These guidelines and performance measures address these long standing design flaws and will be incorporated into the SMART² Network designs.

The Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) confirms that upgraded pedestrian safety features, such as crosswalks and signals, decrease pedestrian injuries and fatalities. The installation of High-Intensity Activated Crosswalk (HA WK) and preempted signals, as well as the addition of street plantings, will improve pedestrian safety and predictability. Expanded bicycle design features such as bike lanes will also raise drivers’ awareness and increase safety. Youngstown’s residents will enjoy a safer place to walk and bike, resulting in lives saved, reduced injury, enhanced ADA compliance, and improved quality of life. Applying U.S. DOT guidance and discounted at 7%, the estimated value of crashes avoided as a result of the SMART² Network project is $17.05 million.

Applying Proven Countermeasures

A road diet can be a relatively low-cost safety solution, particularly where only pavement marking modifications are required to implement the reconfigured roadway design. When planning in conjunction with reconstruction or overlay projects, the change in cross section may be completed without any additional cost. Applying a road diet to an urban arterial has proven to result in a 29% reduction in total crashes per the CMF Clearinghouse.
**Existing Infrastructure Deficiencies**
The SMART² Network’s 2017 pavement condition ratings ranged from Poor to Fair. Poor roadways include Commerce Street, Front Street, and Fifth Avenue. Fair roadways include Rayen Avenue, Phelps Street, and Federal Street. Eastgate and the City of Youngstown are developing asset management strategies to maintain pavements, bridges, and culverts at a Fair or greater rating to comply with Performance Measures in development under the FAST Act. The SMART² project is timed in tandem with Youngstown’s resurfacing schedule. The City of Youngstown, in partnership with Eastgate and the Ohio Department of Transportation, are further crafting strategies for maintaining an over-sized transportation system. An estimated 3.3 miles of road will be converted to bike lanes, resulting in immediate repair and maintenance savings. Additionally, increased travel demand strategies such as walking, biking, and use of public transportation will reduce daily wear and tear. WRTA frequently maintains and replaces its assets, as evidenced by the 65% reduction in the average age of its fixed-route fleet, from 11.8 to 4.1 years between 2013 and 2017. WRTA’s Asset Management Plan insures a fleet of fixed-route and paratransit buses that meet or exceed State of Good repair standards.

Current pedestrian amenities such as sidewalks, crosswalks, and signals are outdated, in disrepair, and/or are not ADA compliant. The SMART² project will remedy these situations. Partners are also in discussion to secure permanent and sustainable revenue sources for long-term operations and maintenance of other project components, including pedestrian amenities and a Bike Share system.

Lastly, concurrent green infrastructure improvements in the project area will reduce stormwater related costs, including flooding. Discounted at 7%, the estimated state of good repair benefits (inclusive of the residual) are $5.26 million.

**State of Disrepair**

**Pavement Condition Ratings**
2017 Pavement condition ratings range from Poor to Fair along SMART² roadways. Poor roadways include Commerce Street, Front Street, and Fifth Avenue. Fair roadways include Rayen Avenue, Phelps Street, and Federal Street. Eastgate’s asset management plan is scheduled to be completed in FY 2019.
Continuing Economic Recovery
The SMART² Network increases the region’s economic competitiveness in three very important ways:

First, it strategically and safely connects the key economic engines of the Mahoning Valley, including the medical center (Mercy Health), manufacturing centers (industrial business parks to the East and West), academic centers (YSU, EGCC, and City Schools K-12), residential centers (home to employees, student, low-income families, and senior housing), and technological centers (America Makes, YBI, MVICC). This connectivity will spur investment and employment in the region’s highest job density area.

Second, it stabilizes property values through a complete streets network that has been proven by Smart Growth America and numerous studies to reduce vacancies by up to 60% and double retail sales. According to Walk Score, a 1% increase in walkability and bicycle friendliness increases home values by $500-$3,000.

Third, public and private investment in the SMART² Network will lead to new wealth, business retention and growth, and help spur additional private investment. BUILD funding will enhance transportation routes bordered by 350,000 square feet of building space and enable redevelopment of some 144 acres, which coupled with improved safety and quality of life will help achieve and exceed all goals of the BUILD program.

Safe walking and biking, as transportation alternatives for trips of short distance, result in real savings in household budgets and in reduced healthcare costs. Efficient access to jobs through multimodal choice will provide the region’s workforce with transportation alternatives to reach major employment centers, further reducing congestion-related expenses. The current analysis calculates the removal of more than 171,000 vehicle miles traveled annually in the SMART² Network project impact area. Applying a discount rate of 7%, the total property premium gains are calculated at $8.87 million over the analysis period. Travel cost savings contribute another $61,000 to local budgets over the analysis period.

Leveraging Private Investment
Opportunity Zones
Eastgate and the City of Youngstown will work to identify opportunities to leverage the recent designation of Downtown Census Tracts as Opportunity Zones (see area in red to right) that will be eligible for “Opportunity Funds” to invest in economic development to receive a 10-year federal tax break.
SMART² project implementation offers numerous environmental benefits.

**Improved Air Quality**

Air quality will increase and pollutants will be reduced through planting of additional trees, and the establishment of green spaces will mitigate heat islands making the surrounding environment cooler and cleaner. Auto emissions are reduced due to active transportation, resulting in air quality improvements. These increased emission reductions will ensure air quality standards attainment with both the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency and US EPA. Applying U.S. DOT’s guidance for the pollutant factors and discounted at 7%, the estimated **value of the improved air quality** associated with auto diversions is **$70,000 annually**. Active transportation will also reduce vehicular miles traveled, further reducing emissions.

**Reduced Energy Consumption**

LED lighting will replace high-pressure sodium lamps.

**Stormwater and Watershed quality enhancement**

Green infrastructure will expand permeable surfaces and provide water filtration by reducing stormwater runoff, benefiting the watershed. Sewer separation will assist in Youngstown achieving compliance with the U.S EPA’s consent decree to reduce combined sewer overflow.

**Stormwater Benefits**

Green infrastructure will expand permeable surface and provide water filtration by reducing stormwater runoff, benefiting the watershed. Sewer separation will assist in compliance with the U.S EPA’s consent decree to reduce combined sewer overflow.
Qualitative Benefits
The project will enhance the quality of life for residents, visitors, patients, students, and employees in downtown Youngstown, surrounding neighborhoods, and throughout the region. A greater variety of transportation choices within the community will enhance access to social services, healthcare, education, employment, and entertainment. Residents will have a greater range of services, entertainment, employment and educational opportunities, accessible through new and improved multi-modal connections. These quality of life enhancements support the Mahoning Valley’s economic competitiveness by creating more attractive places for people to live, work, and play. The SMART² Network also reconnects disconnected and fragmented neighborhoods to these important educational, employment, recreational, retail, and healthcare services. This vibrancy is critical for Youngstown and the region to attract and retain skilled and educated labor that will help diversify the economic base. An educated workforce is necessary for the new technology, knowledge and service-oriented economy that is emerging in Youngstown.

Public Health Benefits
Mahoning County (Youngstown) ranks 86th out of 88 counties in Ohio for its black infant mortality rate. In reviewing the health of at-risk mothers and the social determinants of health they face, obesity and related ailments are dominant. In 2017, the Mahoning County District Board of Health launched the Pathways HUB to reduce barriers for women at risk of poor birth outcomes from having healthy pregnancies and babies. The HUB coordinates the greatest needs of mothers, including unlimited mobility support. Reliable transportation is a great barrier for at-risk mothers who need to shop for healthy foods and attend prenatal appointments. Investing in the network will provide safe and reliable access to multimodal transportation options to aid in this critical public health initiative.
Innovative Planning and Partnerships
The SMART² Network builds on a decade of regional planning work which has resulted in strategies that support a vibrant community with fewer people and resources. The Youngstown 2010 plan, authored in 2005, received national recognition for strategically “right-sizing” a community after significant population decline. That plan resulted in the strategic consolidation of community services, creative new community partnerships, attraction of new and diverse businesses, and an increase in public/private partnerships. The SMART² project now provides the next step -appropriate redesign of transportation infrastructure to move toward an efficient, well connected community, enabling economic growth through connections which enable a new technological economy.

The SMART² project will serve as an innovative and successful economic recovery model for the numerous communities throughout Appalachia and the Midwest that have experienced similar challenges. Youngstown’s persistence and resilience, coupled with this much needed Department of Transportation support, will provide an economic and community recovery model that can be replicated throughout America.

Innovative Mobility and Technology
The innovative SMART² Network includes autonomous transit, enabled through the support of DriveOhio. Preferring to implement the technology in a compact urban environment having a tech-savvy population, DriveOhio views the SMART² Network area as a “near perfect” early stage technology deployment site for implementation of autonomous urban transit and scalable to other urban areas.

The SMART² Network also includes the innovative Computer Aided Dispatch/Automatic Vehicle Location (CAD/AVL) technology through the MyValleyStop smartphone application deployed by WRTA. This smartphone technology informs riders when an autonomous shuttlebus or any WRTA transit will arrive. Passengers will be able to precisely time their departure from home, work, or school to board a transit bus at any specific stop in the SMART² Network.

Public/Private Partnerships
Digital Wayfinding
Digital wayfinding kiosks will provide real time transit information for all autonomous shuttle and connecting routes. Kiosks will monitor air pollution, temperature, and available parking spaces. Spaced at one per major street block, these kiosks will provide free high-speed Wi-Fi, wayfinding services for tourists, and device charging. Leased digital advertising will cover long-term operational and maintenance costs.
Autonomous Shuttles
The Youngstown SMART\textsuperscript{2} Network will integrate technology into a modern and efficient multimodal transportation system that will provide for autonomous and connected vehicles through the installation of a dedicated shuttle lane, fiber optic conduit, and ancillary traffic control and data gathering devices.

SMART\textsuperscript{2} will capitalize on Ohio’s position as a leader in autonomous vehicle testing and deployment. DriveOhio, the state’s center for smart mobility, will bring a number of public and private design, development, testing, and regulation organizations together under one umbrella to provide the SMART\textsuperscript{2} Network with the technical, legislative, and procurement support to implement an autonomous transit shuttle within the project area.

DriveOhio will support and advise Eastgate and the City of Youngstown to ensure compliance with Governor Kasich’s Executive Order to streamline project development and comply with all regulatory requirements.

DriveOhio conducted a field visit of the SMART\textsuperscript{2} project site with Eastgate’s Executive Director and found Fifth Ave and Rayen Ave to be an advantageous test site for two autonomous transit shuttle routes based on physical roadway configuration and excess vehicular capacity that is easily adaptable for a dedicated shuttle lane to be installed. The project location is also highly desirable as a testing environment due to Downtown Youngstown having residential, medical, office and educational uses in close proximity. In addition, the proposed installation of fiber optic lines in the project area will enable data to be collected, shared, stored and analyzed and serve any roadside radio units required by the shuttle vendor.

Public/Private Partnerships

Smart City Communications
Multiple private telecommunications providers have offered their support for SMART\textsuperscript{2} advancing Downtown Youngstown as a Smart City. Telecom providers including Involta and Everstream have been engaged in support of providing fiber capacity to support autonomous shuttle and digital wayfinding technologies. AT&T, as evidenced in their letter of support, is willing to partner with the city in support of CVAV implementation and exploring 5G service.
Innovative Project Delivery
Procurement for Advanced Technologies

As SMART2’s project footprint is completely within the existing public right-of-way, the utilization of excess existing pavement capacity will help to expedite deployment of autonomous transit at a reduced cost, making Downtown Youngstown an ideal setting for shuttle technology deployment.

As evidenced in their July 3, 2018 letter of support, DriveOhio is committed to providing technical, legislative, and procurement support of the SMART² project and will:

- Convene public/private partnerships with prospective autonomous shuttle vendors and fiber and wireless carriers to connect infrastructure within the SMART² Network.
- Work with vendors to implement best practices for the incorporation of an autonomous shuttle and placement of any necessary roadside sensors.
- Coordinate roles and responsibilities for collection and dissemination of traffic monitor information and performance data with WRTA, City of Youngstown, ODOT, safety services, and other project partners.
- Advise Eastgate, WRTA and the City of Youngstown in developing the project in accordance with the Governor’s Executive Order avoiding the need for local legislative or regulatory action.
- Assist in the procurement process for autonomous vehicle and technology vendors.
- Guide Youngstown in preparing for connected and autonomous vehicles.

Public and Private Entities Support
DriveOhio
Many public and private organizations across Ohio are engaged in the research, development and testing of autonomous and connected vehicle technologies. DriveOhio connects all of these entities together under one umbrella, creating a more comprehensive and collaborative environment that makes it easier for them to drive advancements in smart mobility.
**Innovative Financing**

**Leveraging Downtown Revitalization Districts**

**Capitalizing on a New Funding Mechanism**

The City of Youngstown is currently exploring the implementation of several Downtown Redevelopment Districts (DRDs) within the project area to provide innovative financing for long-term maintenance and operations of proposed SMART² enhancements. The Ohio General Assembly recently enacted H.B. 233 which enables municipalities to create Downtown Redevelopment Districts (DRD). A DRD functions similar to a Tax Increment Financing (TIF) District, but offers municipalities additional options in funding projects and programs with funds generated by the DRD.

The City’s anticipated DRD implementation timeline would conclude before obligation of the SMART² project:

- **Summer 2018:** Determine and delineate historic properties with the State
- **Fall 2018:** Select historic structures and seek outside review of DRD footprint
- **Winter 2019:** Draft economic development plan and DRD ordinance
- **Spring 2019:** Initiate public review and selection of board

**Innovation Districts**

An Innovation District is a subarea located entirely within a DRD, enclosed by a continuous boundary, and equipped with a high-speed broadband network capable of download speeds of 100 Gbps. DRD proceeds within an Innovation District may be used for loans or grants to qualified businesses (i.e. tech or R&D) or to incubators and accelerators that provide services to qualified businesses. With multiple fiber optic lines in place (see right), the project area is ripe for Innovation District implementation. The establishment of DRDs/Innovation Districts will leverage MVICC, YBI’s campus, and America Makes to attract back-office employment to the region.
Coalition Building
The SMART² Network project is a clear demonstration of the collaboration and trust amongst the community anchor institutions, city residents, and local and state governments. This project is the result of a multi-year grass roots effort by several community partners to strategically, aggressively, and collectively pursue comprehensive regional economic development. The process has incorporated community engagement through public meetings, workshops, and design charrettes. The SMART² Network project development process has had many related benefits, including successful implementation of smaller successful roadway enhancements within the downtown area, increased academic and research partnerships, and collaborative business attraction efforts. SMART² is the product of numerous public, private, non-profit, educational, institutional, and community partners who are committed to successful project implementation.

Building off Recent Momentum
SMART² will allow Youngstown and the Mahoning Valley region to reverse outward migration by expanding upon recent and ongoing public and private investments in the project area, including the $30 million Mahoning Valley Innovation & Commercialization Center (see upper right) the $3 million Youngstown Foundation Amphitheater (see lower right), Mill Creek MetroParks Connector trail, and $20 million West Coast Chill Can manufacturing and research facility.
County Sales Tax
Since 2009 WRTA has been funded by a 0.25% county sales tax. Sales tax revenue has grown from $4.2 million in 2009 to $7.5 million in 2011. This sales tax became permanent in 2017.

WRTA is able to provide county-wide dial-a-ride service to the general public and has expanded its fixed route service beyond Youngstown to serve more remote and rural cities and townships. WRTA is fiscally sound.

Transit User Fees
WRTA charges user fees for fixed route bus service and loop service at the rates detailed in the table to the bottom right. Multi-ride passes, daily passes, and 31-day passes are also available for purchase.

Future Sources of Revenue: On-Street Parking Revenue
Eastgate, in coordination with the City of Youngstown, is currently undertaking a study to assess the City’s downtown parking supply and make recommendations as to how parking rates, collection times, and locations can be optimized to increase on-street parking turnover and revenue.

Currently, the City charges for on-street meter parking in scattered locations from 8 am – 8 pm, however, enforcement ends at 4 pm. Revenues do not exceed costs of equipment and operations, resulting in the City subsidizing on-street parking by $25,000 each year. The City is looking for a solution for this expense.

A comprehensive geospatial analysis of on-street and off-street parking infrastructure will be conducted, including ownership, structural integrity, code compliance, number of stalls, signage, and payment method. Usage rates will be compiled to determine turnover rates and the market-value of parking. The analysis will lead to recommendations for land use, on-street parking zones, park pricing implementation, and future considerations such as electric vehicle charging stations and intelligent mobility.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WRTA Fares for Fixed Route Bus and Loop Service</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regular Adult</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced Fare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student (with proper I.D.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfers* (Regular)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfers (Reduced)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Hitting the Ground Running
Advancing a Shovel-Ready Project

The SMART² Network project will proceed to obligation by the statutory deadline (June 30, 2020) as evidenced by the following:

- All sources and uses of the funds needed to implement this project have been identified and secured. (See Page 8 for additional details on project commitments and costs).
- There has been a substantial amount of planning work accomplished to date.
- Eastgate, an experienced and high performing Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO), has tremendous management experience in the successful completion of numerous major transportation projects.
- WRTA has a dedicated source of operating funds.
- WRTA and the project partners have the capacity to cover the operating costs of the autonomous shuttles.

Documentation of this operating source of funds is provided in the supplemental materials available at: http://eastgatecog.org/SMART2

Due Diligence
Preliminary engineering plans have been prepared along Fifth Avenue which will expedite project delivery.
Technical Feasibility
Excess Roadway Capacity Provides Flexibility

Sponsor’s Technical Capacity
The SMART² Network project is technically feasible, and there are no risks to project delivery. Because the project expands upon the larger citywide system of complete streets, bike and pedestrian facilities, the project draws on the technical experience and lessons learned in constructing and managing those prior projects.

The community’s progress in securing state funding for, and sourcing and implementing previous bike and pedestrian lanes demonstrates its ability to undertake the BUILD project and will build on committed funding to ensure that the SMART² Network serves as the central node in the region’s transportation system.

Manageable Traffic Volumes
The project involves right-sizing of key sections of the city’s road capacity of the transportation network to meet the needs of a community focused on increased multimodal access and connectivity, rather than expedited freight movements in support of heavy manufacturing no longer located Downtown. Based on recent traffic studies, no significant transportation/traffic effects are anticipated. Updated traffic studies will be completed along with final engineering design.

Repurposing Excess Roadway Capacity
Both Fifth Avenue (existing 5-lanes / ADT 9,273) and Rayen Avenue (existing 4-lanes / ADT 4,533) provide excess pavement width and roadway capacity that allow for maximum flexibility in detailed design to accommodate any required refinements without the need for design exceptions, utility relocations or right-of-way acquisition.
**Project Schedule**

**Accelerated Project Delivery**

The SMART$^2$ Network project can begin detailed design immediately upon receipt of BUILD funds. Preliminary engineering is already underway and is expected to be completed in 2020, well in advance of the obligation deadline. All project limits are within the right-of-way under agency control. A detailed project schedule is available in the attachments and on the project website.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2018</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2022</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**BUILD Award**

**Design**

**Bidding, Award & Pre-Con**

**Construction**

June 30, 2020 Obligation Date

**Project Opening**

2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Required Approvals**

Implementing the Regional Vision

The SMART² Network project has evolved from a generation of thoughtful and thorough planning at both the municipal and regional levels. The community has worked collaboratively and deliberately to define new ways of improving the economic viability of the Mahoning Valley with an emphasis on rural inclusion. The implementation of the SMART² Network will align with the recommendations of several prior community planning initiatives which are listed below. The SMART² Network makes Youngstown rightsized and multimodal, and links the largest employers with the most innovative academic and research centers in the region. The SMART² Network provides opportunities for low income residents by providing convenient, safe and reliable transportation.

The SMART² Network has been identified in the Eastgate 2040 Metropolitan Transportation Plan. This SMART² Network project team and regional leadership have shown a proactive approach to leveraging public and private investments for high impact and transformative investment benefiting all of Eastern Ohio Appalachia.

The applicant, Eastgate Regional Council of Governments, is the designated Metropolitan Planning Organization for Mahoning and Trumbull Counties of Ohio. Eastgate’s General Policy Board sponsored this proposal that will leverage recent and planned transportation infrastructure investments by proposing this multi-modal network that links those resources that are critical to an overall economic resurgence of the broader region.

This proposal exemplifies all facets of efficient investments of public funds, and will promote economic competitiveness, efficient mobility, a cleaner environment, enhanced quality of life, and improved safety.

The SMART² Network will **advance** redevelopment and infrastructure **goals** of the following regional **initiatives**:

- Eastgate’s 2040 Metropolitan Transportation Plan Update, 2018
- Eastgate’s FY2019-2023 Transit Development Program, 2018
- Team NEO’s Aligning Opportunities in Northeast Ohio, 2017
- Center City Youngstown Complete Street Design Guide, 2017
- City of Youngstown and Youngstown City School District’s Safe Routes to School Plan, 2016
- City of Youngstown’s Economic Development Strategic Plan, 2015
- City of Youngstown’s Downtown Vision and Action Plan, 2015
- Northeast Ohio’s Sustainable Communities Consortium’s Vibrant NEO 2040, 2014
- City of Youngstown’s Neighborhood Conditions Report, 2013
- Youngstown Redevelopment Code, 2013
- Youngstown State University’s Campus Centennial Plan, 2010
- City of Youngstown’s Youngstown 2010, 2005

Each of the above plans are available at: [http://eastgatecog.org/SMART2](http://eastgatecog.org/SMART2)
Environmental

Required Approvals

NEPA Process
The SMART² Network project will be built entirely within the existing right-of-way, which is already under agency control with no significant environmental effects to streams, wetlands, endangered species, cultural and historic resources, or environmentally sensitive areas. A Categorical Exclusion (CE) will be required. Project work will take place almost exclusively in the existing ROW in areas that are disturbed and have been extensively modified as result of past development activity. No controversy is expected on environmental grounds and no land acquisition is proposed, except a voluntary land donation from YSU adjacent to the existing right-of-way, thus no residential or non-residential displacements, or impacts to Section 4(f) resources would occur with the project.

A preliminary environmental review and analysis conducted for the project has not identified significant environmental effects, or issues of controversy associated with the project with required coordination activities summarized below. Based on preliminary environmental review, the project is well positioned for timely completion of environmental review and approval processes well in advance of the June 30, 2020 obligation deadline.

Cultural Resources
Section 106 consultation activities with the Ohio Historic Preservation Office (OHPO) will be completed in 6 months. An initial review of archival data on the Ohio History Connection’s online database reveals the following:

- **Archaeology** - there are very few inventoried archaeological resources within the Youngstown city limits generally, and the built urban landscape of the project area suggests a low potential for encountering intact archaeological deposits
- **Viewshed** - there are National Register listed and eligible properties present adjacent or near the project area, including the Arlington Avenue Historic District, the Wick Park Historic District, the National Register listed Stambaugh Auditorium, the eligible Baltimore Thru Truss, and National Register listed properties. Visual impacts of proposed aboveground infrastructure to National Register listed or eligible properties will have No Adverse Effect to historic properties under Section 106 of the NHPA as the proposed streetscape improvements will be beneficial to the setting of the historic property as perceived by local residents and visitors.

Ecological Resources
The project is not expected to involve in-water work and initial site reconnaissance has not identified sensitive plants, wildlife, wetlands, or other habitats in the area.

Context Sensitive Design
Proposed streetscape enhancements will be implemented in a context-sensitive fashion that complements the character of historic buildings within Downtown as established in the Youngstown Complete Streets Design Guide to ensure No Adverse Effect to historic properties under Section 106 of NHPA.
State and Local Approvals
Governor’s Executive Order

No Additional Legislation Needed
The SMART² autonomous transit shuttle service can be implemented without the need for additional state or local legislation through Ohio Governor John R. Kasich’s Executive Order 2018-01K signed on May 9, 2018 that authorizes autonomous vehicle testing in Ohio and lays out a roadmap for how the automotive industry can test their technologies in the state.

The Executive Order lays out the statewide requirements for autonomous vehicle testing on any Ohio public road or highway. Companies that want to test autonomous vehicles will have to register with DriveOhio, assure their vehicle can operate safely, and comply with all traffic laws. There must be a designated operator who is responsible for the vehicle at all times.

It also creates a pilot program to let DriveOhio connect cities with companies who are looking for the best places in Ohio, including Youngstown, to refine their technologies.

Executive Order 2018-01K

Establishing DriveOhio as the Statewide Center for Smart Mobility

WHEREAS, Ohio has always been a leader in transportation innovation because the safe and easy movement of people and goods from place to place is a cornerstone of our economic success; and

WHEREAS, Ohio’s geography, location within a single-day’s drive of 60 percent of the North American population, four seasons of weather conditions, and mix of urban and rural areas provide a diverse landscape and strategic environment for researchers and manufacturers to test and develop advanced transportation technologies; and

WHEREAS, Ohio law encourages the testing and deployment of new technologies to facilitate and maximize the efficient use of Ohio’s transportation assets; and

WHEREAS, Ohio has recently invested in six smart mobility projects, of which four are smart highways covering 164 miles of roadway, including the U.S. 33 Smart Mobility Corridor, and two are connected-city pilots, to test and refine advanced mobility technologies; and

WHEREAS, Ohio is home to the Transportation Research Center (TRC), the largest independent automotive proving grounds in North America, which is constructing the most expansive autonomous and connected vehicle testing center in the country; and
Community Engagement
Local Support for Proposed Improvements

Public Forum
Eastgate hosted a Public Meeting for SMART² on July 5, 2018, to gather community input on preferences for the SMART² Network. The open house was attended by 37 members of the public who provided feedback on what modes of travel and nodes of activity they frequent within the project area. In addition to participating in a series of interactive comment stations, 6 attendees wrote letters in support of the project.

Public Engaged
The project has received favorable press and widespread support from local stakeholders as evidenced by social and news media coverage of the project.
Federal Transportation Requirements
40 U.S. Code Subchapter IV

Federal Wage Rate Certification
SMART² will comply with all Federal wage rate requirements included in subchapter IV of chapter 31 of title 40, U.S.C. Please see the signed federal wage rate certifications included with the supplemental materials at:
http://eastgatecog.org/SMART2

Assessment of Project Risks & Mitigation Strategies

Low Risk Project
There is essentially no risk to timely completion and delivery of the project, as the SMART² Network builds on experience gained through the successful completion of similar improvements in other locations in the city, there are few remaining variables complete the bike and pedestrian network. DriveOhio will provide Eastgate with technical, legislative and procurement support relative to autonomous vehicles.

Lack of Environmental Red Flags
The Project limits are within the right-of-way controlled by the City. Real estate easement acquisition costs: The Project has received letters of support from and donations of right of way to complete the project. No additional ROW acquisition is required.

Ready & Worthy of BUILD Investments!

A BUILD investment of $10,853,192 in the SMART² Network will continue the economic resurgence taking place across the Mahoning Valley by enhancing multimodal connectivity to anchor institutions that provide regional access to opportunities for advancement.

Please join our project partners who have committed a $10,541,689 Non-Federal Local Match and support this catalytic investment in Eastern Ohio Appalachia.