Transit Security Reassessment
Current and Future Capital Needs

Prepared by:
Eastgate Regional Council of Governments
City Center One Building
100 E. Federal Street, Suite 1000
Youngstown, Ohio 44503

May 5, 2016

EASTGATE REGIONAL COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS

Serving Northeast Ohio since 1973

The Eastgate Regional Council of Governments is a multipurpose Regional Council of Governments for Ashtabula, Mahoning and Trumbull Counties, as established by Section 167.01 of the Ohio Revised Code. Eastgate is the agency designated or recognized to perform the following functions:

- Serve as the Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) in Mahoning and Trumbull Counties, with responsibility for the comprehensive, coordinated and continuous planning for highways, public transit and other transportation modes as defined in Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century (MAP-21) legislation.

- Perform continuous water quality planning functions in cooperation with Ohio and U.S. EPA.

- Provide planning to meet air quality requirements under MAP-21 and the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990.

- Administration of the Economic Development District Program.

- Administration of the Local Development District of the Appalachian Regional Commission.

- Administration of the State Capital Improvement Program for the District 6 Public Works Integrating Committee.

- Administer the area clearinghouse function, which includes providing local government with the opportunity to review a wide variety of local or state applications for federal funds.

- Administration of the regional Rideshare Program for Ashtabula, Mahoning and Trumbull Counties.

- Conduct demographic, economic and land use research.

- At General Policy Board direction, provide planning assistance to local governments that comprise the Eastgate planning area.

- Administration of the Clean Ohio Conservation & Revitalization Funds.

GENERAL POLICY BOARD (2016)

Chairman - Mark Hess, Trumbull County Transit

1st Vice Chairman - Casey Kozlowski, Ashtabula County   2nd Vice Chairman - Pat Ginnetti, Mahoning County

Mayor Eric Augustein, Village of Beloit	Mayor James Melfi, City of Girard
Jerrome R. Brockway, Ashtabula County	Trish Nuskievicz, Director, Trumbull County Planning
Peggy Carlo, Ashtabula County Commissioner	Mayor Nick Phillips, City of Campbell
Mauro Cantalamessa, Trumbull County Commissioner	Mayor J. Michael Pinkerton, Village of Sebring
Dan Claypool, Ashtabula County Commissioner	James J. Pirko, Citizens Advisory Board
Mayor John Darko, City of Hubbard	Representative, Trumbull County
David Ditzler, Mahoning County Commissioner	Daniel Polivka, Trumbull County Commissioner
Robert Faulkner, Trumbull County Transit Board	Kurt Princic, OEPA NE District Chief
James Ferraro, Director, Western Reserve Transit	Carol Rimedio-Righetti, Mahoning County Commissioner
Authority	Randy Samulka, Citizens Advisory Board
Mayor Douglas Franklin, City of Warren	Representative, Mahoning County
Frank Fuda, Trumbull County Commissioner	Mayor Thomas Scarnecchia, City of Niles
Fred Hanley, Hubbard Township	Mayor Timothy Sicafuse, Village of Poland
Mayor Arno Hill, Village of Lordstown	Randy Smith, Trumbull County Engineer
Glenn Holmes, Mayor, Village of McDonald	Mayor Dave Spencer, Village of Craig Beach
Don Iannone, Growth Partnership of Ashtabula County	Mayor Terry Stocker, City of Struthers
Mayor James Iudiciani, Village of Lowellville	Anthony Traficanti, Mahoning County Commissioner
Mayor William Jones, Village of Washingtonville	Anthony Urankar, District Deputy Director, ODOT District 4
Mayor Harry Kale, Village of New Middletown	Mayor Lyle A. Waddell, City of Newton Falls
Mayor Bernie Kosar, Sr., City of Canfield	Joe Warino, City of Canfield
Paul Makosky, City of Warren	Mark Winchell, Ashtabula County
Mayor John McNally, City of Youngstown	Joanne Wollet, Poland Township Trustee
Mayor Shirley McIntosh, Village of West Farmington	Mayor James Woofter, City of Cortland

TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE (2016)

Chairman-Gary Shaffer   Vice Chairman-Kristen Olmi

CITIZENS ADVISORY BOARD (2016)

Chairman-James J. Pirko   Vice Chairman-Randy Samulka

Transit Security - Current and Future Capital Needs

1. Introduction

The Western Reserve Transit Authority (WRTA) is an authorized regional agent that is eligible to receive federal and state financial aid for the operation of public mass transportation in Mahoning and Trumbull counties. The regional transit authority completes an annual application for capital, planning, and operating assistance that is submitted to the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) for funding consideration under 49 United States Code Section 5307. WRTA's Fiscal Year Funding Apportionments and Allocation for the Urbanized Area Formula Program is published by FTA in the Federal Register on an annual basis.

There are three transit grantees that receive FTA Section 5307 funding in the Youngstown, OH-PA urban area. The WRTA, Trumbull County Transit Board (TCTB), and the City of Sharon, distribute the FTA Section 5307 Urbanized Area Formula Program Apportionments annually through a Letter of Agreement. This agreement specifies that the WRTA is responsible for meeting the entire Ohio portion of the Public Transportation Security Projects, and the City of Sharon has full responsibility for Public Transportation Security Projects for the meeting the Pennsylvania portion of the urban area.

In FY2016, Eastgate conducted a reassessment of the Transit Security - Current and Future Capital Needs component of the 2040 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP). This reassessment will evaluate the WRTA's transit security projects that were originally programmed in the 2040 MTP.

When a transit authority applies to FTA for Urbanized Area Formula Program Funds, they must annually certify that they are spending at least one percent of Section 5307 for transit security projects or that such expenditures for security systems are not necessary.

Examples of appropriate security expenditures that were evaluated include: surveillance equipment at a facility or within the transit system; facility perimeter security and access control systems; increase lighting of a facility or transfer point; fencing, security access readers, contracts for security training services, or staff time allocated to address security issues.

Security staffing varies depending on the size of a transit authority. Regardless of the system size, security is the responsibility of every employee for the prevention of incidents. Some examples of transit personnel who play a role in security related functions are those who observe a revenue transfer, clerks, and personnel assigned to open or close a transit facility. The WRTA utilizes one administrative and one transit employee to manage security operations. These two employees do not devote their time exclusively to security operations.

If a grantee does not meet FTA's one percent security criteria, the grantee is required to submit to FTA regional office an explanation, and adequate documentation on why the security criteria was not necessary.

The WRTA currently contracts private armed security officers from 6:00 a.m. to 11:00 p.m. on Monday through Friday, and from 6:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. on Saturdays and Sundays. The law security officers patrol the entire system, including the downtown Federal Station Passenger Terminal during all hours of operation. During the evening, the transit system is patrolled by security officers who travel between the Administration and Maintenance Facility, and Federal Station. These security officers report to the WRTA's administrative personnel for guidance, assignments and security monitoring performance.

Section 5307 Urbanized Funds expended by the WRTA for security purposes is outlined in the Letter of Agreement to Distribute Federal Transit Administration Section 5307 funding in the Youngstown OH-PA bi-state urban area. These agreements are signed yearly based on the federal transit allocations that are published in the Federal Register.

The estimated cost for the replacement of existing and future security capital equipment from 2016 through 2040 is $2,297,728.

The WRTA's service area encompasses approximately 452.4 square miles crossing many political jurisdictions. Current personnel and security officers require a level of knowledge over policing powers in different jurisdiction if a security incident occurs. The transit authority depends solely on the assistance of local police departments for resolving security issues. If the WRTA was to establish their own transit police, then the authority should have strong working agreements with the different local police departments.

The establishment of a Transit Safety and Security Task Force is a resource tool that can be used to focus on the coordination of security operations between local jurisdictions, standards of operations, training, communication requirements and emergency response procedures. The WRTA currently has a Safety Committee that meets monthly with their three unions to discuss all aspects of safety operations and security issues.

It is very important that the WRTA establish written agreements with neighboring communities when responding to security incident, since the WRTA service area cover portions of Trumbull County. Currently, if an incident occurs in a neighboring city, township or county, the law enforcement agency responding to an incident prosecutes according to their own policies and procedures.

2. *Prevention through Training*

The prevention of security incidents requires all transit and police personnel to have and maintain a level of readiness to handle the incident. The level of readiness is contingent on the level of training provided to current personnel. Training should include:

- Ongoing training for safety operations and procedures,
- Training for proper safety procedures for the employees, operators, police, fire, and ambulance,

- Emergency response bus evacuation training,
- Inter-jurisdictional coordination training,
- Sensitivity training for handling of the homeless,
- Sensitivity training for victims,
- Public relations and assistance, and Crisis response training programs.

A transit system cannot be expected to train each employee to handle every type of incident. Employees can be trained to recognize different incidents that may occur in a system as well as the proper procedures for handling security incidents. Once a system develops policies and procedures for handling security incidents then training of employees should include awareness sessions, role playing, videotapes and films, and training drills with exercises. The WRTA provides ongoing security training for its employees with the prior approval of the Safety Committee. The transit authority also notifies its employees of security issues by enclosing flyers in the employee's paychecks.

Awareness sessions serve to inform employees of the proper procedures to take when an incident occurs. Once employees become familiar with policies and procedures, role playing helps illustrate to the employees how different individuals react in an event of a crime. Role-playing activities can be videotaped and used as training materials to show employees if proper policies and procedures were followed during the role-playing activity. The system's expectations of an employee plan of action during an incident should be clearly understood before the training session is over. At the end of a training session unannounced mock drills and exercises can be performed periodically for modifications to training sessions. The WRTA's Safety Committee evaluates recommends and approves any special safety and security training that is deemed necessary.

3. Communication Initiatives

The level of communication for transit security operations and procedures between transit personnel and emergency response teams reinforces executing any plan of action to correct future incidents. Communication initiatives to enhance a system should include:

- The installation of two-way video communication surveillance cameras,
- The installation of emergency response buttons at facilities, buses and transit hubs,
- The installation of vehicles tracking systems,
- The installation of text pager systems for sending immediate text messages,
- Establishing verbal codification systems between operators, dispatchers, and other personnel, and
- Emergency phone communication systems.

The communication initiatives that the WRTA is currently reviewing to enhance the system are the bus tracking capabilities, silent alarms, and security cameras on buses to monitor passengers.

It is recommended that transit systems coordinate the sharing of information, establish agreements for roles and responsibilities within political jurisdictions, develop and implement safety communication procedures, and participate during training exercises for any transit security program. Through social media and marketing techniques, a transit system can encourage transit ridership by communicating to the public how secure riders feel on their transit system. If a patron perceives the system to be unsafe then ridership tends to decline.

4. Public Perception

The perception of safety at the WRTA terminal is unrelated to actual statistics reported by WRTA on their National Transit Database Report (NTDR), which is submitted to the Federal Transit Administration every year.

The public perception of safety depends on the actual visibility of protection, and an individual fear of crime. A patron's perception of an unsafe transit system is directly related to visual images of trash, graffiti, evidence of vandalism, and physical deterioration of the system. The WRTA's physical infrastructure and the rolling stock are well maintained and rated in good condition. The transit system utilizes the expertise of their own maintenance crews and on various occasions, contracts services to insure that the existing facilities are clean and in good working condition.

There is also the perception that if a system operates during off peak hours then the security of the system is at a minimum. There are also individuals who have been witnesses to a crime, been a victim of crime, or have heard of a crime hold negative perceptions that they will be a victim of crime if they rode on a transit system.

The WRTA's interior and exterior video surveillance system has helped local authorities solve any incidents that might have occurred on a bus, or any traffic collision disputes which protected the transit authority from false accident claims. The public now considers the WRTA surveillance equipment as a beneficial tool to enhance the safety and security of the community.

5. Education

Safety and Security education and visibility efforts can assist the transit authority in changing the unsafe perceptions of patrons and key leaders in Mahoning County. Safety and Security education should include:

- The development of safety brochures for public distribution,
- Conduct yearly safety evaluations,
- Review any incidents and develop a plan of actions,
- Provide visible uniformed patrols and surveillance cameras with monitors,
- Review any facility design that obstructs visibility,
- Increase lighting at bus stops, shelters, and transit hubs,

- Review and correct facility maintenance,
- Establish and encourage anonymous reporting,
- Conduct passenger relations training of operators,
- Have a designated spokesperson for speaking to the media, and
- Establish good working relationships with the media.

6. Current Security Expenditures

WRTA invested in security upgrades through renovation and expansion of its Administration facility on Mahoning Avenue, and Federal Station in downtown Youngstown, funded by the Federal Transit Administration's American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA) program. Security upgrades included the installation of new lighting for the interior and exterior of the two facilities, and state of the art surveillance equipment. The interior space of Federal Station was also renovated and modernized for a one call communication center and provides rental space.

WRTA Administration Building

Federal Station Passenger Terminal

7. Future Capital Improvements

The schedules for security equipment replacement are divided into four capital purchasing categories. The first schedule lists the replacement of Interior and Exterior Security Cameras with Monitors to be installed at the WRTA's Federal Station Terminal. The security cameras with monitors are assumed to have a useful life of five (5) years. The acquisition cost within the replacement schedule is increased by approximately 4% per year, using 1997 costs estimates as the baseline figures.

The second schedule lists the replacement of Interior Security Cameras and Monitors at the WRTA's Administration Building, located on Mahoning Avenue. This equipment has an expected useful life of five (5) years. The schedule uses 1997 cost estimates as the baseline figure and assumes a cost for inflation of approximately 4% per year.

The third security replacement schedule is for the purchase of Exterior Security Cameras with Monitors to be installed at the WRTA's Administration Building. The equipment has an expected useful life of five (5) years. The schedule uses 1997 cost estimates as the baseline figure and assumes a cost for inflation of approximately 4% per year.

The last security replacement schedule is for the purchase of Building Alarms at the WRTA's Administration Building and at Federal Station Terminal. The buildings alarm systems have proven to be very durable, and were therefore assumed to have a useful life of fifteen (15) years. The replacement schedules use 1997 cost estimates as the baseline figures and assume a cost for inflation of approximately 4% per year.

FY 2020 - FY 2040
(beginning July 1, 2020)

Security Equipment Replacement Schedule - I

Year	Capital Improvement	Total Project Cost	Federal Funding Source	Federal Share	State Share	Local Share
2020	Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Administration Bldg.	135,200	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	108,160	3,520	13,520
2025	Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Administration Bldg.	164,500	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	131,600	16,450	16,450
2030	Exterior Security Cameras w/ monitors @ Administration Bldg.	200,200	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	160,160	20,020	20,020
2035	Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Administration Bldg.	243,500	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	194,800	24,350	24,350
2040	Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Administration Bldg.	296,300	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	237,551	29,630	29,630
2028	Security Fencing@ Administration Bldg.	90,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	72,000	9,000	9,000

Security Equipment Replacement Schedule - II

Year	Capital Improvement	Total Project Cost	Federal Funding Source	Federal Share	State Share	Local Share
2020	Interior & Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Federal Station	52,700	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	42,160	5,270	5,270
2025	Interior & Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Federal Station	64,100	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	51,280	6,410	6,410
2030	Interior & Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Federal Station	78,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	62,400	7,800	7,800
2035	Interior & Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Federal Station	94,800	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	75,840	9,480	9,480
2040	Interior & Exterior Security Cameras with monitors @ Federal Station	115,400	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	92,320	3,746	3,746

Security Equipment Replacement Schedule - III

Year	Capital Improvement	Total Project Cost	Federal Funding Source	Federal Share	State Share	Local Share
2030	Building Alarms @ Administration Bldg.	50,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	40,000	5,000	5,000
2021	Building Alarms @ Federal Station	21,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	16,800	2,100	2,100
2031	Building Alarms @ Federal Station	27,300	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	21,840	2,184	2,184
2040	Building Alarms @ Federal Station	35,500	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	24,800	2,480	2,480
2020	Building Alarms @ Administration Bldg.	60,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	48,000	4,800	4,800
2030	Building Alarms @ Administration Bldg.	78,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	62,400	6,240	6,240
2040	Building Alarms @ Administration Bldg.	101,400	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	81,120	8,112	8,112

Security Equipment Replacement Schedule - IV

Year	Capital Improvement	Total Project Cost	Federal Funding Source	Federal Share	State Share	Local Share
2021	Bus Surveillance Systems	80,000	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	64,000	8,000	8,000
2026	Bus Surveillance Systems	97,332	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	77,866	9,733	9,733
2031	Bus Surveillance Systems	118,421	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	94,737	11,842	11,842
2036	Bus Surveillance Systems	144,075	FTA 49 USC Section 5307	115,260	14,408	14,408

8. Conclusion

The WRTA has implemented several policies and procedures listed in this report under the four categories Prevention through Training, Communications Initiatives, Public Perception, and Education. The transit authority continues to fully identify, discuss, and determine how security issues can be proactive. The system does not have to wait for an incident to occur, but continues to review existing incident records and safety procedures. The transit agency continues to identify problem areas and formulates solutions. The solutions are then detailed and tested before they are adopted. Once the WRTA adopts policies and procedures, the transit agency should require that every employee participate in a safety and security training program.